



152

**PROVINCIAL LOCAL GOVERNMENT COMMISSION**  
**Inspection, Monitoring & Evaluation Cell**  
**Government Of Sindh**

Karachi dated 14<sup>th</sup> November 2006

Subject: Minutes of the Working Group-1 Meeting held on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2006

(List of participants attached)

First meeting of the Working Group (WG)-1 of M&E committee was held in the committee room of PSU-SDSSP on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2006. The meeting started in the name of the almighty, the most beneficent and the most merciful.

The PD-SDSSP requested the Chair that Director General Monitoring (Work & Services Department) was specially requested to attend this meeting due to their important role in monitoring and he has graciously accepted the invitation. The chair Co-opted DG (Monitoring) as member in the working group-1. At the onset the Program Director (PD) informed that this meeting was scheduled to review the following issues:

1. Review of the Terms of References of the Working Groups
2. Introduction to Existing Monitoring Frameworks;
3. Review and approval of the Delegation Plan approved by the Chief Secretary Sindh and substantiated by majority of District Governments;

The discussions on all these issues and decisions taken are as under: -

**1. Review of the Terms of References of the Working Groups;**

After detailed deliberations, it was decided to request DG Provincial Local Government Commission for initiating process for establishing a research seat at Civil Services Academy, Tando Jam for the purpose of continued academic support in strengthening the local governments and capacity building of public representative and the officials. It was also decided that DG (PLGC) would explore opportunities for funding through Sindh Devolved Social Services Program (SDSSP) and Decentralization Support Program (DSP).

**2. Introduction to Existing Monitoring Mechanisms/Frameworks: -**

PD-SDSSP apprised the WG that as mentioned in the Monitoring Framework the monitoring tools do exist in every major department and are working as well however the

157

issue is the strengthening of these mechanisms and their conformity with the devolved system. He also informed that these monitoring Cells / Directorates have also been issuing annual monitoring reports regularly. PD presented the reports from Planning & Development Department and Provincial Ombudsman for the perusal of the Group.

Director General Monitoring, W&S Department informed that after devolution of powers to District Governments the Works & Services Department has established a separate Directorate for monitoring of the provincial and district investments in roads and buildings with a view to ensure proper utilization and quality check. He further informed that the department is considering strengthening this mechanism by re-designating it as "Directorate General Monitoring & Support". He presented Monitoring reports for the year 2004-05 and 2005-06 for the perusal of the Group.

Working Group appreciated the on-going efforts of the departments in monitoring functions. WG appreciated the steps being taken by the W&S Departments advised DG (Monitoring) to forward these reports to all Nazims and DCOs, through the Secretary (W&S) with a direction to follow the recommendations and findings of these reports. Group emphasized that these findings be kept in mind while preparing new schemes.

The Chair briefly highlighted the monitoring functions of the PLGC and enquired if there were any other monitoring comprehensive framework available that could be used by the provincial departments. PD-SDSSP informed that the provincial government had started a scheme through CMIE&IT for establishing a Provincial Monitoring Framework (MF). Participants were of the view that this MF be shared with other departments and local governments for its review, ownership and implementation. AS (Regulation) informed the Group that a separate Implementation Wing has also started working in SGA&CD on Monitoring of various programs/projects.

The WG decided that Secretary Implementation would be requested to send a representative to attend the meetings of this Working Group. It was also decided that the WG and other departments would review the MF created by the CMIE&IT for ownership and implementation.

### **3. Review Delegation Plan and Status of Implementation by District Governments**

The Group with reference to following three basic principles laid down in the monitoring framework reviewed the delegation plan and the district implementation reports:

- efficacy of devolved powers whether a correct balance has been struck between the powers to be retained at the provincial level and those that need to be devolved
- adequacy of administrative and financial powers already devolved
- problems in implementation and exercise of the devolved powers

The Chair observing the nature of the task, constituted a core Group under Additional Secretary (Regulation) with Director (A&A), PLGC and Program Officer (ID) SDSSP to give its recommendations on the devolved administrative powers envisaged in the Delegation Plan within 15 days.

The working Group-1 discussed the District Governments response and their Recommendations on Devolved Administrative powers and gave recommendations as under:

S. No:	DGs' Recommendation	Decision of WG
1	All the vacant posts in DG Departments such as Revenue, F&P, Education, Health and other departments including clerical staff may be filled	Considering the difficulty being faced by the DGs, the Working Group was of the view that the important vacant positions be filled as early as possible and requested AS (Regulation) SGA&CD to convey the current policy on recruitment in next meeting
2	Offices of the newly created districts and TMAs need special attention	PD, SDSSP informed that the SDSSP is providing men power support to the new districts. It was also observed that on the direction of the PFC, the finance department has provided additional funding to cater for the needs of the new local governments (DGs and TMAs) in the current year.
3	While the offices of the DCOs and EDOs have been sufficiently strengthened, there is a need to strengthen the lower offices as well to facilitate the performance of administrative functions more effectively	Considering the need for further devolution of powers within the district offices, the Group supported the recommendation and directed PSU-SDSSP to seek a report from all DCOs to identify the capacity gaps and provide proposals for strengthening of lower district offices in the next meeting of the Group.
4	A committee may be formed to look into many other delegations that various acts and rules warrant	The WG observed that the Delegation Plan already contain Amendments in some 52 Major/minor laws but further work is still required.  It was decided that the LGD may be requested to take up the consequential amendments in other laws and the Special Secretary, LGD was requested to communicate the status in next meeting of the Group.

5	There is the scope of making rules under RSO-2000. SPG should consider preparing rules under RSO-2000 and provide the concept of Authorized Officer in these rules	Considering adequacy of powers with the district functionaries, the Group requested AS (Regulation) SGA&CD to examine and inform status in next meeting
6	Process for establishment of the district cadres needs to be put on fast track	AS (Regulation) SGA&CD informed that this was already under consideration. He was requested to bring the current position for the knowledge of the WG in the next meeting
7	Devolution or creation of the district offices of EPA	The Group desired that this proposal may be referred to Environment & Alternate Energy Department for comments
8	Nazim may make transfers and postings within CDGK in case of BPS-17 officers as well	AS (Regulation) to examine the issue and report in the next meeting
9	Creation of an independent Cadre for the postings of TMOs	Group observed that there was no need to create a separate cadre as SCUG Service already exists as an independent cadre of officers and that these posts are also meant for the Officers of DMG and PCS cadres.  WG also observed that there should be a clear job description for all the newly created positions in local governments. LGD was requested for comments in this regard.

Mr. Afab Ahmed Memon  
Deputy Program Director, DSSP

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the chair and with a resolve to meet during the early part of December 2006 for firming up the recommendations for M&E Committee.

153  
148

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

Program Support Unit  
Sindh Devolved Social Services Program  
Finance Department, Government of Sindh  
Karachi dated 14th November, 2006

**In Chair**

1 Member (Technical-1)/Chairman  
Mr. Ghulam Arif  
Special Secretary (LG)  
Local Govt. Dept

2 Special Secretary (LG)  
Local Government Department,  
Karachi

3 Mr. Mehtab Ahmed  
Additional Secretary (Regulation),  
SGA&C Dept

4 Additional Secretary (Regulation)  
SGA&C Department, Karachi

5 Mr Farouq Ahmed Siddiquee  
Director(A&A)  
SLGC

**SUBJECT: INTRODUCTORY MEETING OF WORKING GROUP-I ON DELEGATION PLAN**

Mr. Abdul Kabir Kazi,  
Program Director, SDSSP

**Member/Secretary**

Mr. Iqbal Ahmed Memon  
Deputy Program Director- DSSP

Mr. Aftab Ahmed Memon  
Program Officer, SDSSP

Abdul Kabir Kazi  
Program Director-SDSSP  
Finance Department

A copy is forwarded for information to:-

1. PS to ACS, Local Government
2. RO to Secretary Finance
3. PS to Special Finance Secretary (Dev/SR)
4. PS to DG, PLGC, Karachi