

Thatta Visit Report

Dated 26 July, 2005

Mr. Abdul Kabir Kazi (Program Director),
Dr. Shereen Narejo (Program Officer-Health),
Mr. Imtiaz Bhatti (Program Officer-Water Sector)

The visit to district Thatta comprised of three parts:

1. Review of all sectoral activities with DCO
2. Site Visit.

Health Sector

EDO (Health) Thatta

During briefing the EDO Health informed that an amount of Rs. 38.786 (M) has been allocated for health sector of district Thatta. Out of this total amount Rs. 32.401 (M) has been booked in both revenue and capital expenditure during financial year 04-05. The allocation is being used in both components i.e., Revenue and capital expenditure. The expenditure on revenue component has been incurred whereas; civil work on identified localities has been initiated. The list of such abstract was provided by EDO (H) during meeting.

Capital Expenditure: In capital side the repair and renovation work on following health units have been started:

- Repair and renovation of TB Ward Civil Hospital Thatta.
- Repair and renovation of Taluka Hospital Sujawal i) TB ward ii) Kitchen.
- Repair and renovation schemes at health dispensaries i) Pir Haji Allahdino Shah ii) Ahmed Khan Khor.
- Repair and renovation of BHUs in districts (viii schemes).

Civil work on all these schemes has yet to be finalized.

Site Visit: The Program officer Health along with EDO Health visited the site of Civil Hospital Thatta where repair and renovation of TB ward was started. Complete roof treatment of ward was started @ the cost of 1.6 (M). This whole work was undertaken through Works and Services department and unfortunately it was observed that there is complete aloofness between EDO (H) and officials of Works and Services Department. Since the work was in very preliminary stage hence no comment on quality could be offered at this stage. Unfortunately other schemes could not be visited due to shortage of time.

Revenue Expenditure: In revenue component district government had included following items:

- a. Purchase of vaccine.

The EDO informed that in all 51,000/ vials of Hepatitis “B” were procured. Having found that district does not have enough capacity of cold chain only 11,300vials were retained and rest were returned back to company. In the meanwhile cold chain equipments (05) were procured. and now they are again in contact with the firm for supplies. It was informed further that district health office is planning to start Hepatitis “B” prevention campaign after vacation.

b. Purchase of instrument/equipments.

The following items have been procured by EDO office and items were physically available.

ETT and Echo cardio machine for Cardiac ward of Civil HospitalThatta. **(Yet to be received).**

02 mini laboratory units for Taluka Hospital Sujawal and Mirpur Sakro.

Emoc instruments for safe motherhood program.

Anti malarial spray equipments.

Blood Bank Refrigerators for mini labs.

Out of two one split Air Conditioner has been received.

It is also pertinent to mention that these instruments and equipments have not yet been distributed for want of inspection from Industries department.

Purchase of Ambulances. EDO (H) informed that purchase of Ambulances have been processed through EDO (F&P) which is under process. *PSU conveyed its concern that the process should be completed soon because there are several activities dependant on this like Hepatitis B campaign, Safe motherhood program etc.*

Hiring of Staff: EDO (Health) informed that under Safe motherhood program they have completed the recruitment process for hiring of 20 midwives, female vaccinators, LHVs, and driver has already been finalized basis. However, due to non availability of Ambulance services these employees have not been taken on board.

Besides, this district government as well as provincial health department must ensure availability of specialist people to run laboratory equipment cardiology equipment etc.

Coordination: During visit one thing was evident that there was no coordination between the officers of Works and Services department and EDO office Health. There is dire need to develop a liaison between the relevant agencies. Accordingly, Program Director SDSSP discussed this issue with DCO Thatta who promised to look into the affairs personally.

Education Sector

EDO (Education) Thatta

During briefing the EDO Education and Officials of Education Works and Works and Services department briefed about the progress made so far. It was informed that amount total Rs. 43.015 (M) have been allocated for Education. Out of this total amount Rs. 14 (M) have been utilized for hiring of staff and purchase of furniture etc. Whereas, rest of the amount is being sent on Capital component.

Site Visit Report

For Education sector 04 sites were visited by PD SDSSP, Program Officer Health and DO Education & Works department.

Government Primary school Ameer Bux Jakhro	(Construction of boundary wall)
Government Primary School Ayub Belecho	(Construction of New room)
Government Primary School Bair Khaskheli.	(Construction of boundary wall)
Government Primary School Chatto Chand	(Construction of New room)

Observations

Quality work was average.

Violation of basic guidelines was very much visible like construction of one room schools without taken into account the basic amenities like water and lavatories.

There was no coordination between all relevant officers of works and services Education F&P etc. Therefore basic flaws were it was evident in planning and execution of the schemes.

Least knowledge to Education works officials about ongoing schemes.

Community has not been properly mobilized. This is pertinent to mention that with little conversation of PD SDSSP community agreed to provide piece of land and space for Government Dispensary at village Chatto Chand having about 250 -300 houses.

District Government officials were directed to conduct feasibility study and send report to PSU.

Water and Sanitation Sector

The defunct TMAs Kharochan and Keti Bunder

At the outset the PD informed the DCO that the share of the defunct TMAs of Kharochan and Keti Bunder could not be released owing to the yet unsettled issue of juridical authority over these defunct TMAs, which now are called Union Councils. SDSSP needs to definitely know as to which of the adjoining Talukas shall have juridical authority over these *special* UCs and release to them the funds to be spent within the limits of the defunct talukas.

It was agreed that the Local Government Support Officer would look into it and submit report to the DCO, who will float proposal on the juridical issue. As soon as the matter is decided, the PSU would release funds for these former talukas to the TMAs responsible for their administration.

TMA Thatta

The TO (I&S) Thatta informed that the TMA received its SDSSP share in April, but it has yet not been able to issue work-orders as the Local Government Department had stayed further progress subsequent to an internal controversy among the TMA officials. The TO informed that the issue has been resolved now and the TMA has been allowed to go ahead with the schemes' implementation.

The Programme Director regretted that the matter was not brought to the notice of the PSU and so much valuable time had been lost to a petty controversy among the TMA officers. He also made clear to the TMA officials that the releases for the new financial years would be withheld until the last year's grant was not fully utilized.

TMA Shah Bunder

The TO (I&S) Shah Bunder informed that the TMA had proposed to spend the entire SDSSP grant for the taluka on rehabilitation of the drainage system of the town of Choohar Jamali and that 50% funds have been utilized so far.

Other TMAs

It was informed that all the remaining Talukas except Mirpur Bathoro and Ghora Bari had submitted their ASPs, but could not get their share of the grant.

The PD informed the TMA officials that those TMAs that had completed all their formalities in May 2005 were released their share. Those which could not be released funds in the previous financial year would be considered for release of their share for the current financial year. The guidelines for preparing Annual Sector Plans for financial

year 2005-6 are being drafted and would be circulated in August and further process for releasing funds would be initiated.

Site Visit

After the meeting, the Programme Officer (WSS) visited the sites of the proposed WSS schemes in Thatta. During the visit it transpired that the TO (I&S) did not know the details of the schemes, which ostensibly he had designed and costed and made part of the annual sector plan prepared by him. While the TMA's Office Superintendent briefed about the salient features of the scheme, it became glaringly evident that neither proper engineering nor technical aspects were evaluated nor was due attention paid to the cost estimation side.

The TMA officials were not sure as to what length of the pipe line leading to the town's main filter plant was in bad condition and required changing. The pipe line otherwise did not appear to be in a very shabby condition. In addition, this Rs. 3 million rehabilitation scheme involves purchase of new water pumps and motors and repair of the filters and reservoir. However, one could see the plaque at the plant laid by the GOC Hyderabad in the year 2000 which shows that an amount of Rs 4,900,000 was spent for uplift of that same filter plant. Within a period of mere four years the project requires a major uplift seems to be a very tough proposition.

The case of two sewerage pumping stations within the town limits of Thatta proposed to be rehabilitated for Rs. 1 million each was not much different. On the whole, stations required de-silting and some repair works, but how much it would actually cost is something for concerned engineers to evaluate.

Recommendations

After visit it is recommended that:

1. District Government Thatta may be directed to review their schemes once again and ensure that they are inline with the directions/instructions given to them time to time.
2. In the meanwhile fund utilization should not be allowed until DCO assure for meeting the required obligations.
3. PSU must evolve monitoring and evaluation mechanism and sector officers should spend one week into the districts to see whether the activities are being carried out efficiently and effectively.
4. In Health Sector Role of DG Health must be recognized with the help of Administrative department and his representative should be taken onboard during various visits.