



Program Support Unit
Sindh Devolved Social Services Program
Finance Department, Government of Sindh
February 15, 2005



Note for Chief Economist

Subject: **Plan for Sustainable Development through Participatory Planning**

While reviewing the progress on various policy actions the Provincial Steering Committee (PSC) for the Sindh Devolved Social Services Program (SDSSP) during its third meeting on November 4, 2004 had decided that the Chief Economist, Planning & Development Department would assist Program Support Unit (PSU) of the SDSSP in the preparation of a plan that envisages the participation of community and their elected representatives in the development process. Minutes of the meeting circulate vide our letter No. FD-PD (DSSP)5(3)2004 dated 12 November 2004.



2. Following the decision of the PSC the PSU has prepared a draft plan for the sustainable development through participatory Planning giving the structures of participation and transparency envisaged in the Sindh Local Government Ordinance (SLGO) 2001.
3. Submitted for your review and approval.


Chief Economist


Abdul Kabir Kazi
Program Director

GOVERNMENT OF SINDH

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT THROUGH PARTICIPATORY PLANNING

1. The Demography:

Sindh, with a geographical area of about 141000 square kilometers are 17.90% of the landmass of Pakistan and accommodating some 30.50 million souls or 23% of the country's population, is the second largest province. It plays an importance role in the national economic and development agenda. With 48.9 percent, it has the highest concentration of urban population as compared to an overall average of 32.5 percent, making it the most urbanized province in the country. Sindh is also a cultural melting pot, where migrants from other provinces have settled in search of opportunities and have brought along their own traditions and languages.

The province contains a mere 23 percent of Pakistan's population however its contribution to Pakistan's economy is much higher. Sindh collects about 70 percent of Pakistan's income tax and 62 percent of sales tax. A major share of Pakistan's industry, Oil and Gas fields, livestock and fisheries are located in Sindh.

Karachi, the capital of the province with the country's only sea-ports, contains 30 percent of the Sindh's total population and 63 percent of its urban population. As a result, it excises a strong influence on the economy and employment patterns in the province. Industries have failed to develop in other parts of the province owing to the influence of the skilled and educated people from the rural areas to Karachi for employment purposes. This migratory process is further empowering the rural areas of Sindh.

Sindh's natural endowments consist mainly of agriculture, fisheries, livestock and poultry arid zones, coastal and marine ecosystems, water resources etc. The natural assets of the province they subsist in are under stress due to poor management, lack of financial and human resources and the non-involvement of communities in the management and development forces. Increasing poverty and unemployment further restrict sustainable natural resources management.

Indus water is crucial to Sindh's survival as 95 percent of its farmland acquires water from the Indus Basin Irrigation System and 97 percent of all water is used for agriculture. The ground water available in Sindh amounts to only three to five MAF and is potable only in 28 percent of Sindh's geographical area.

Sindh is plagued by acute water insecurity. In 1971-72, when Sindh's population was about 14.0 million, water availability was 39.3 MAF. In 1988-89, when the population rose to 30 million, water availability was reported at 48.5 MAF. The water problem is further aggravated by defective irrigation practices, like flood irrigation, lack of drainage facilities and the absence of properly organized management and distribution system of this resource. The absence of lining in canals and water channels result in leakages that cause water logging and seepages in the urban water transmission and the distribution system. Meanwhile sea intrusion in the delta has made most of the subsoil in the aquifer saline.

Sindh is major producer of grain fruit and vegetables. However, crop yields are low have been almost stagnant for the last decade. This is due to salinity caused by leakages from canals and from sea intrusion in the delta and control districts. Over irrigation and badly managed water distribution also contribute to for crop yields.

Sindh contains a sizeable portion of Pakistan's livestock and poultry. 27 percent cattle, 28 percent buffalo and 40 percent of poultry are in Sindh. There has been

a considerable increase in the number of livestock and poultry but there has been little improvement in the production performance of the breeds.

Sindh holds a primary position in Pakistan in fisheries of Pakistan's 1050 kms coastline, including the Indus delta, 350 kms are in Sindh. In addition almost 100 percent of the brackish, 65 percent of the fresh water and 71 percent marine fish resources of Pakistan are in Sindh.

According to an estimate, only 5 percent of monthly income is spent on energy, demonstrating the deplorable living conditions in Sindh. This is despite the fact that Sindh has replaced Balochistan as a major producer of oil & gas and also has the largest coal deposits in Pakistan. Although its electricity capacity has been increasing.

2. Human Development:

In terms of the Human Development Index (HDI) ranking within Pakistan, the urban areas of Sindh are reported to have the highest ranking with a HDI of 0.659, greater than for Pakistan, as a whole. But the rural areas of Sindh have an H.D.I of 0.456, which is the lowest in Pakistan. This suggests a large urban rural disparity than in any other province of the country. There are indications the over two thirds of the households in rural Sindh maybe classified as vulnerable despite the fact that Sindh has the highest per capital income in Pakistan. There is a correlation between high incomes and urbanization especially in Karachi. More-over, more than 11 million men and women in Sindh are un-employed and around 15 million live below the poverty line. The un-employment ration in Sindh was 25 percent during the 1980, but it increased to 33 percent in the 1990s. the persisting drought conditions during the past number of years, crippling tax structures imposed under the reforms, fluctuations in the exchange value of the rupee, a break down of infrastructure, and a failure to control

lawlessness all were the causes for an economic crisis. It has also adversely affected public spending on social and physical infrastructure related to water supply, sanitation, health and education. Sindh's child mortality rate is 109 per 1000 live births as compared to a national average of 103. The state of education in Sindh is best reflected in its literacy figures and in the serious disparity between rural and urban areas. The provincial literacy average is reported at the 46.70 percent with urban, at 65.20 percent and rural at 26.90 percent. According to 1998 census, it is 39.50 percent for men and 13.10 percent for women in the rural areas.

The total number of schools in Sindh are reported at 43035, out of which some more than 3500 are reported as ghost or non functional. Health facilities total to 1358 and the non-functional units add to about 650, similarly, the total number of water supply and sanitation schemes in the rural areas are reported at 1399, and the non-functional are about 353 schemes.

Despite sizeable investments over the past fifty eight years, the indicators in the socio-economic development sectors compare quite poorly with those in the other provinces. There are a number of reasons for the situation.

A sustainable development cannot be single handedly undertaken by and through the public sector alone. It is therefore considered imperative to consult and involve all those stakeholders, beneficiaries and concerned, who are likely to make use of and benefit from the point of view of collective ownership and maintenance of the facility thus created. There is a need to increase public sensitivity to development needs and problems and involvement in their solutions and foster a sense of personal responsibility and greater motivation and commitment towards sustainable development.

3. Transparency

Transparency is the hallmark of the devolved system. The law itself has provided a structure of checks and balances that ensures the transparency in the financial as well as administrative matters. The Sindh Government has also promulgated following rules to further regulate the matters related to budgeting, financing, accounting and audit: -

- i. Sindh Local Government Local Fund Budget Rules 2001
- ii. Sindh Local Government (Imposition of Taxes Rules) 2001
- iii. Sindh Local Government (Contract) Rules 2001
- iv. District / Town / Taluka / Union Administration Budget Rules 2002
- v. New Chart of Accounts (District and TMAs) 2003
- vi. Local Government Internal Audit Rules 2004
- vii. Local Government Fiscal Transfer Rules 2004

4. SDSSP – Strategy for Sustainable Development

The Sindh Devolved Social Services Program SDSSP is a direct budgetary support to improve health, water and sanitation and education. The ADSSP draws strength from communities who believe in progress and thus a prosperous Sindh. The main emphasis is given on the achievement of targets by enhancing the service delivery capacity of the relevant departments in the district and Taluka / Town Administration by providing additional financing.

The social services in Sindh present a miserable picture and compare poorly with social services of other provinces. Sindh has the lowest per capita spending on social sectors among the four provinces. Sindh has higher levels of illiteracy, malnutrition and mortality ratios and this poor social status has a major impact on its economy environment and water resources. In this backdrop, the condition

of women, the most significant vulnerable group has also worsened and the situation calls for an urgent remedial measures.

The outlined state of affairs has strengthened the Government of Sindh's resolve to reduce poverty, deepen devolution, and improve social sector development. Government of Sindh has therefore, initiated governance reforms programs to further the devolution agenda as envisaged in the Sindh Local Government Ordinance 2001(SLGO). DSSP with the full assistance of the partners from all layers of new governance system would carry forward the agenda of devolution under SLGO and would cause sustainable decentralization of the management of basic health and education services to the district governments and water & sanitation functions to the Taluka / Town Municipal Administration (TMA's).

The ground reality is, that the district and taluka / town administrations lack the required resources and the expertise to completely and independently take over this huge responsibility. Although, as a result of concerted efforts of the local and provincial governments which have manifested themselves in improvements in service facilities, staff attendance and supply the performance of the social sector appears to be showing the signs of progress. Never the less, the local governments require sustained support, both financial and technical – to enable them to overcome the challenges that they are facing in the initial period of devolution.

With a view to ensure an effective role for the civil society organizations, it has been decided to earmark at least 25 percent of the funds for community based organizations such as school management committees, village development associations and health boards, and non-governmental organizations.

Poverty reduction and improved governance being the cross cutting issues applicable to all, the focused areas through SDSSP would be the following:

Education Sector. The SDSSP envisages providing assistance for rehabilitating non-functional and abandoned schools and providing facilities, text books and stipends, and contracting local teachers, preferably females, on merit. It aims to support SMCs up-to class 12, to improve and operate these schools. SDSSP aims at further strengthening and supporting the education reforms through making the community, a development partner, a responsible owner and a manager through financial and technical support capacity building, mass awareness, improved governance, and monitoring.

Health Sector. In the Health Sector, it is envisaged to promote the basic package of health services contract female local staff, support and establishment of health board and patients associations to improve the maintenance and operations of health facilities, and introduce financial reforms to improve the quality affordability, and continuity of health services SDSSP aims at supporting the Public Private Partnership and involvement of the community in the service delivery.

Water, Sanitation & Environment Sector. In WSS sector the SDSSP is aiming at providing institutional support alongwith financial assistance to enable the TMAs in sustaining and improving the devolved service. It is envisaged to rehabilitate the non-functioning water supply schemes and improving the municipal services in general. SDSSP seeks to build the capacity of the TMAs to conduct infrastructure and consumers surveys and develop master plan, develop interim policies or drinking water, sanitation and solid waste management and improve basic water and sanitation services through partnership with communities. It will institutionalize execution of the water and sanitation schemes through village development Associations and make them responsible for delivery and maintenance. The Government of Sindh has further devolved administrative and financial powers in the TMAs including development planning, transfers and financial authority.

Government will adjust and strengthen the role of PLDs to focus on policy reforms, regulate the sector, and monitor and evaluate sector performance; and will strengthen sector training institutions for capacity building and support of the local governments. PLDs would be fully involved in the management of Technical Assistance loan for this purpose.

5. SLGO - A Participatory Approach

The government of Sindh is promoting to target the poor, women and vulnerable groups of the society through public dialogue on policy issues. The law SLGO-2001 promotes for the concepts of public private partnership, community involvement in the service delivery and development, public dialogue, social audit and community participation in the affairs of administration. Very structure of the local government set up includes the concept of participation and consultation. The public representatives are elected only at the Union Council (UC) level. The Naib Nazim of a UC than forms part of the TMA Council while the Nazim becomes member of the District Council. Thereby the presence of the representatives elected at the lowest tier of governance is ensured in the forums where the decision making regarding planning (Identification of schemes) and budgeting takes place. UC Councilors are also proactive in the monitoring of the schemes in their areas.

Such participatory approach will be the central theme in determining the criteria and pattern for the District Government and TMA sector plans. It will encourage rational distribution of services, staff and funds, through the conditional grant mechanism. Deliberations for the preparation of sector plans will start with the consultation process including seminars and workshops in the districts and in Program Support Unit (PSU) and policy dialogue in the Provincial Steering Committee. Process of preparation and execution of the sector plans would follow the provisions envisaged in the SLGO-2001.

6. Field Difficulties and Issues

The difficulties and problem being encountered in the socio economic sectors pertaining to service delivery and the related aspects are more or less the same in all the districts of Sindh and since these have to be handled through the same system, the actions conceived are also not very different from sector to sector, district to district and the Taluka to Taluka.

Management Issues

- Shortage of female staff at health facilities
- Weak coordination between various sectors and lack of an integrated / coordinated plan at the local level.
- Absence of development partners in support of public sectors efforts.
- Poor coverage of the geographical area and the masses by the primary health services.
- Under utilization of health facilities due to lack of compliance on public facilities non presence of medical staff.
- Poor management for delivery of health care services weak management of health system and poor quality of services.
- Poor monitoring arrangement and governance problems.
- Very weak referral system
- Low preparedness for emergencies.
- Shortage and lack of equipment, instruments and needed facilities of pathological labs and blood banks.
- Medical treatment costly and beyond reach of the general public.
- Low level of familiarity of technical and administrative staff with their jobs.
- Lack of monitoring and accountability.
- Lack of transparency and facilities.

- Lack of trust, low rate of education among females and lack of community participation.
- Health facilities at far off distances
- Shelter less dispensaries.

Education Sector

- Low level of participation at primary and middle levels especially of girls.
- Shortage of facilities including buildings, lavatory block, drinking water facility etc.
- Shortage of teachers, especially local female teachers in rural areas.
- Lack of teachers training, pre & in service.
- Low salary and status of teachers.
- Improper / lack of supervisors/ monitoring leading to absenteeism particularly in remote and rural areas.
- Improper location of new schools and with out mapping.
- Un attractive school environment
- Shortage of primary and middle schools both boys and girls.
- Un attractive course and books
- Lack of local teachers and their placement in the settlement.

Health Sector

- Persistence of high maternal morbidity and mortality.
- A large number of obstetric cases / problems go un-attended or reported.
- Prevalence of high infant mortality and major causes of infant deaths.
- Low contraceptive prevalence rate.
- Lack of access to trained birth attendants by mothers.

- Lack of proper awareness regarding maternal issues, family planning and infant and child health care issues.
- Weak health education among masses in general and regarding Hepatitis-B, Measles, Malaria, T.B and HIV-Aids in particular.
- Sanitary conditions in a house hold very unhygienic and availability & access to safe drinking water, poor

Water Supply and Sanitation

- Lack of ownership of the existing facilities by the communities.
- Non payment of user charge and lack of proper maintenance of the facilities.
- Size of facility not commensurate the requirement of the community.
- Non-availability / shortage of funds for maintenance and or extension/strengthening of the facility.
- Lack of awareness concerning hygiene & environment among the general population.
- Lack of civic sense among masses
- Lack of appreciation for the available facility.
- Shortage of skilled persons for running the facility.
- Lack of community participations in the size, type, location and establishment of new facilities.
- Lack of community participation in decision making and running the system.

7. Plan of Action – Leading towards participatory practices

It is the time that some concrete steps are taken to make the endeavor more meaningful, participatory, transparent, accountable and beneficial. The following actions will be taken:

- Mass awareness through press and the electronic media regarding the additional financial and technical support to the Districts Government and Talukas Municipal Administration in the three socioeconomic sectors.
- Awareness and capacity building at all the three tiers of the local government viz, Union, Talukas and District levels through seminars workshops and trainings.
- Survey and mapping of the existing facilities in the three sectors viz Health, Education and Water Supply & Sanitation, along with their status i.e. functional and non functional etc.
- Appraisal funds on the basis of information provided in the Districts Annual Sector Plans
- Constitutions of sectoral committees at all the three tiers of Local Government with clear terms of references Community Participation / Partners in development Monitoring, Management Accountability etc.
- Training and capacity building of members of committees at Union, Taluka, and District levels.
- Monitoring of actions and preparation of quality reports for sharing at all tiers including the provincial government.
- Expedite devolution of administrative and the financial powers from Government of Sindh, in the three sectors to DGs and TMAs including development planning transfers and financial authority.
- Expedite improvement in social sectors financing and flow of funds.
- Expedite and promote participations Linkages and Accountability.
- Facilitate Government of Sindh in targeting the poor, women and vulnerable groups.
- Assist Government of Sindh in rationalizing services and set minimum standards.
- Encourage community participation and Public Private Partnership.