

**Further Devolve Social Services to District Governments and  
Taluka Municipal Administrations**



Report on Third tranche Action A-i

SPG Monitors the Implementation of Delegation of  
Administrative and Financial Powers and Published a Report

---

Program Support Unit  
Sindh Devolved Social Services Program

3<sup>rd</sup> floor, State Life Building # 3  
Dr. Ziauddin Ahmad Road, Karachi  
Tel: 021-9201005- 8 Fax : 021-9201004

[www.sdssp.gov.pk](http://www.sdssp.gov.pk)

## **Implementation of the Monitoring Framework**

The Sindh Local Government Ordinance has brought in a major shift in roles and responsibilities of different tiers of governance in Sindh. While the policymaking and oversight roles of the provincial government have got added significance the implementation and execution authority has been devolved to lower tiers. Government of Sindh in a major exercise of redefinition of roles and responsibilities carried out some significant changes in government structures in 2001 onwards. However seamless blending of provincial and local governments roles require much more adjustment, especially in the area of monitoring and evaluation. In this backdrop of public sector administrative and financial reorientation, Government of Sindh has designed a Monitoring Framework to review and reform existing institutions and practices.

The main responsibility in the monitoring related activities, of course, lies with two major departments i.e. i) Planning & Development Department, to monitor the development activities from various sources and inculcating the lesson learned in subsequent planning and ii) Provincial Local Government Commission (PLGC) that is responsible for overseeing the functioning of local governments and facilitating the lower tiers in achieving outcomes as per their mandated roles. This report would show that both of these agencies have shown increased institutional capacity for fulfilling their roles.

The Provincial Line Departments have also achieved significant progress in i) policy making ii) standard setting iii) monitoring & evaluation iv) and providing support to local governments.

Despite having noteworthy progress in strengthening the devolution process, a lot remains to be achieved. However, with continued commitment from the government and development partners for sustained efforts toward reinforcing the reform process a real paradigm shift is within reach.

This report examines the efficacy of the existing monitoring arrangements in the provincial and governments and also provides status on the implementation of the monitoring framework.

This report also examines the process for setting standards and benchmarks for service delivery in education, health and water sector.

Abdul Kabir Kazi

Program Director (SDSSP)

## **1. Performance of the Existing M&E Arrangements**

### **1.1 Council Monitoring Committees (CMCs)**

The SLGO focuses on developing policies that promote better public accountability systems at all levels of government and assist the relevant agencies to improve service provision. SLGO provides for the constitution of the Monitoring committees comprising of the public representatives at the local governments' level. The government is in the process of developing rules for the functioning of these committees in monitoring the planning and development processes and the performance appraisal of the service delivery departments. A detailed report on the role of the CMCs is at *Annex-A*.

These committees are performing oversee and monitoring functions as listed in the SLGO-2001. In the current year, the Chairman PFC decided to transfer funds to local governments in two installments of 50% each. 50% would be transferred after getting the council's resolution for approval of the ASP and the remaining 50% would be transferred based on the reports of the council monitoring committee. Such reports are placed at *Annex-Ai*.

### **1.2 Planning & Development Department (P&DD)**

P&DD is the architect of the annual development plan of the province and policy provider for the provincial line departments (PLDs) and local governments in the planning and execution of their development programmes and special projects. P&DD is also the custodian of the development funds which are transferred to the PLDs on its advice hence the P&DD is responsible for tracking the utilization as well. M&E cell of P&DD therefore plays an important role in providing assistance to and guiding monitoring cells of other Departments in monitoring of Development Schemes and activities through collection of monthly progress reports, monthly/quarterly review meetings and publication of an annual review report. These reports provide the basis for analysis and appraisal which helps in preparation of quarterly reports for Cabinet and Committee of Secretaries / DCOs. M&E cell also issues guidelines for provincial /District Governments and Taluka Administration for the resolution of day-to-day issues in the execution of the development schemes. It also monitors the progress of federally and foreign funded Projects. The cell makes field visits to randomly selected projects for inspection and physical monitoring of development Schemes. Department regularly publishes Field Inspection and Annual Review Reports.

### **1.3 Health Department**

After promulgation of SLGO, role of health department (HD) is restricted to policy formulation and monitoring as provincial line department. The scope of the health department is further reflected in the Sindh Health Policy 2005.

The monitoring activities under taken by the HD could be categorized as under:

- a) Development Activities (ADP, funded Program/projects) including capital and revenue components
- b) Procurement of Medicines, Equipment and supplies both at province and districts
- c) Monitoring and regulation of Private Medical Facilities

**Development Activities:** Annual Development Program or development projects are monitored according to the prescription of Planning Manual issued by the Planning Commission of Pakistan using the PC-III Proforma. The reports collected from field every month that shows details regarding financial and physical progress on the scheme.

**HMIS:** Despite various constraints HMIS cell located in the office of Director General (health) collects data from all districts based HMIS units every month. However, regular publication of report is hampered by resource scarcity. SDSSP through TA funds has assisted the department in compilation and publication of the report having data upto 2004.

**Procurement Monitoring and Inspection (PM&I) Activities:** After devolution major portion of purchases pertaining to districts has been devolved. According to new devolved roles and responsibilities districts make purchases and distribute further to health facilities. However, due to capacity constraints of districts and different operational issues, need was felt to streamline the role of department as monitoring and over sighting body as envisaged in Provincial Health policy 2005.

PM&I wing was created in the department with following ToRs:

- The PM&I wing shall provide and coordinate, assistance/Technical support, training and guidance to all procuring officers /offices working under Provincial Health Department/ EDO (H), City /District Governments and Projects/ Programs Health Departments, for developing and improving their institutional frame work and public procurement activities with regarding to Pre-qualification of Manufacturers / Importer, tender, receipt/distribution of goods and medicines etc.
- PM&I wing shall also monitor the implementation of rules/regulations/policies and procedures in respect of pre-qualification, procurement, inspection of medicines/goods and their distribution at teaching hospital (irrespective of BOG), other hospital/institution working under Provincial Health department, under EDO's (Health) and procurement made under projects/programs
- PM&I shall take notice and rectify any mistake /irregularity committed by procuring officers with regard to pre-qualification and tender process.
- Shall call for any information/document from procuring officer related to procurement at any time.

- Shall enquire/investigate any matter relating to pre-qualification and procurement on complain or at its own.
- Shall depute any officer with the approval of competent authority, at district level for monitoring of above mentioned procedure and acts, these officers will submit fortnightly report to PM&I wing, these officers will represent PM&I wing in purchase and inspection committee and also supervise distribution of goods and will insure distribution in accordance of approved indents by the EDO (Health).
- Monitor application of laws, rules, regulation policies and procedures in respect of, or relating to, procurement.
- Monitor the implementation of and evaluate laws, rules, regulation, policies and procedures in respect of, or relating to, inspection or quantity and quality of medicine, instruments/equipments, goods etc and their distribution.
- PM&I shall recommend to provincial government revision/amendments in existing laws/policies or formulation of new procurement law/rules/procedure.
- Monitor public procurement practices and make recommendation to improve governance, transparency, accountability and quality of procurement.
- Provide and coordinate assistance to procuring agencies for developing and improving their institutional framework and procurement activities.
- Submit report quarterly to higher authorities in respect of procurement activities in health department and its subordinate offices.
- Call any functionary of procuring agencies to provide assistance in its functions and call for any information from such agencies in pursuance of its objectives and functions.
- Perform any other function assigned to it by the Government or that is incidental or consequential to any of the aforesaid function.
- All procuring officer shall submit copies of all document related with tender, inspection and distribution to the PM&I wing.
- All procuring officer shall submit copies of allocated and released budget along with source to the PM&I wing within a week.
- All procuring officer shall provide list of pre-qualified firms, sufficient tender enquiries and tender sale receipt to PM&I wing as well to the office of DGHSS for sale

To carry out this mandate and realizing the issues of capacity of districts, PM&I wing has developed a set of procurement guidelines. Training and dissemination workshops have been arranged for different stakeholders so that their capacity to perform inline with rules and procedure could be enhanced. Two workshops in Karachi and Sukkur were held on 10-08-06 and 18-09-2006 respectively. PM&I cell visits various districts regularly to monitor whether activities are undertaken in line with the procedures and guidelines or otherwise. Moreover, reporting as mentioned in ToRs provides an institutional check to correct wrong before being committed.

**Monitoring of Private Medical Facilities:** As a matter of policy, Sindh Government encourages private sector to invest in social sector, but large unregulated private sector in health has created regulatory issues. To check these issues Federal Government in its National Health Policy 2001 and subsequently under Sindh Health Policy Key Area 07 (Regulation of Private Health Sector) Health department has taken initiative to table a bill before the Provincial Assembly according to the draft bill private sector will be taken in to fold to ensure that respective health facility provides the standard quality services vis-à-vis charges. Besides this under Safe Blood Transfusion Act process of registration of all laboratories and their monitoring is going on.

It is clear from above activities that health department is well aware of its role in post devolution scenario and sensitized to the requirement of proper M&E. However, there is need to develop a mechanism which is overarching and takes care of all activities ongoing in the department under various umbrella programs.

#### **1.4 Education Department**

In post-devolution scenario Education Department has taken major steps in revamping its institutional outlook. Department's focus areas are:

- a. Aligning of policies with MDGs and EFA with necessary resource mobilization
- b. Increase effectiveness and accountability of public expenditure
- c. Strengthening of devolution by increasing provincial capacity for policy formulation, standard setting and technical support to district governments
- d. Institutional strengthening of planning, and M&E activities
- e. Streamlining SEMIS, Research, Monitoring & Evaluation, and Planning processes
- f. Quality Assurance and Accreditation
- g. Regularizing human resource recruitment and posting process and
- h. Public-Private Partnership

In 2005 Education Department established Sindh Reform Unit (RSU), for scaling up the institutional capability of the Department. Steering Committee chaired by the Chief Secretary provides leadership for ensuring ownership and linkage between the reform and provincial policies. The RSU's mandate includes data collection and management; program monitoring (direct and through third party validations); policy formulation on the basis of data analysis; making implementation arrangements for various reform interventions; and management and coordination of all donor program and technical assistance inputs supporting education. To strengthen monitoring & evaluation mechanism department has undertaken several important activities, including:

- a. Administrative integration of Sindh Education Management Information System (SEMIS) into RSU, and upgrading of equipment, software and skills in SEMIS.

- b. Upgrading the offices of SEMIS in the districts (DEMIS) and integrating them with the offices of the EDO Education.
- c. Significant redesign of the school census questionnaire to make it more comprehensive to capture full school (student, infrastructure, teacher) information.
- d. Completion of the FY 2005 public school census, and validation of census (3% sample) to verify credibility of data including verification of Grades 6 – 10 girls enrollment for stipend program (Census Report *Annexure -B*).
- e. Carry out the private school census.

The RSU has also developed a system of information management that has integrated the different database (including school census, human resource information, stipend and textbook delivery information). To ensure the transparency and public accountability Department has also made available the stipend, SMC, free text book distribution, and school census data on RSU's website i.e. <http://www.rsu-sindh.gov.pk/>

### **1.5 Local Government Department (LGD)**

The LGD has an important role as the policy maker and monitor for the functioning of the local government. LGD plays this role through its Planning, Monitoring & Evaluation Cell (PM&E Cell). After the inception of devolution the LGD was to perform the role of the policy maker for the local governments so as to facilitate them in the implementation of the devolution agenda. Hence the role as a monitor of the devolution and the devolved agencies became even more vital. To dispense with its responsibilities the LGD restructured this cell providing it more an institutional face to interact with the LGs as well as PLDs having linkages with the devolved system. PM&EC has now been assigned with following functions:

1. Monitoring and evaluation of the working of the local governments / councils;
2. Coordination of the development activities of various departments of the local governments and spatial development programme;
3. Monitoring and evaluation of the foreign funded schemes;
4. Monitoring and evaluation of the provincial based projects like Khushhal Pakistan Programme etc and
5. Monitoring and Evaluation of other developments activities if implemented through Local Governments Departments

Currently, multiple mechanisms for M&E are being practiced as various project modalities are under practice such as federally funded PSDP, Provincial ADP, Senators /MNAs /MPAs schemes and donor funded projects. Development activities through the TMAs are being monitored by the TMAs themselves through the council monitoring committees.

**Khushhal Pakistan Programme (KPP):** KPP was a Rs. 6.235 billion federally funded program. Since the program was primarily focused on the poverty reduction therefore, schemes for farm to market roads, link roads, water supply and drainage, sanitation, village electrification, watercourse linings and parks/playgrounds were included in the program. The Local governments were the implementing agencies for this program. Program was implemented in four phases with 100% utilization of the funds.

**Sindh Basic Urban Services:** The Director PM&EC is the Focal Person in the LGD for designing Asian development bank assisted Sindh Basic Urban Services Project (SBUSP) for which LGD has been identified as Executing Agency. Currently this cell is coordinating with the ADB and TMAs in the process of PPTA. This cell would have the responsibility to monitor the implementation of this project through TMAs. Six towns namely Badin, Khairpur, Dadu, Naushero Feroze, Mithi/ Islamkot and Sanghar have been initially selected for improvement schemes pertaining to water supply drainage and Solid waste management.

**Sindh Devolved Social Services Program (SDSSP):** Director General (PM&EC) has been notified as Focal Person of LGD and represents the department on the Technical Working group of the SDSSP. Process for the preparation and approval the annual sector plans of the TMAs, funding and tracking of the utilization, inspection of the schemes is through the office of the DG (PM&EC). SDSSP and PM&E cell are currently working on a joint strategy to conduct certain studies/surveys for further improving the service delivery in TMAs. With continued efforts of this cell 118 out of 119 TMAs have submitted their ASPs while 88 TMAs have prepared their basic local area / master plans.

**Gender Justice:** This Cell is also assigned to coordinate with other development partners engaged in the province having direct or indirect working relationship with the LGs. The DG (PM&EC) is currently working with UNDP and NORAD on activating District Musalihat Anjumans under “Gender Justice through Musalihat Anjumans Project” focused on mass awareness on the concept and working of the Musalihat Anjumans (Local Arbitrary Councils).

**Coordination with Development Partners:** PM&EC is also assigned the role of a facilitator and coordinator between the LGs and the provincial and federal / provincial utility agencies. Cell assists these agencies in the resolution of internal conflicts that might affect the service delivery functions of the LGs.

### **1.5.1 Water Supply & Sanitation Sector**

Prior to devolution, the water supply and sewerage schemes in the Sindh province were managed by the defunct Public Health Engineering Department (PHED). Since, PHED had relatively qualified and trained staff, within their setup, the department was able to formulate water supply and sewerage schemes. After conceiving the schemes, the PC-I of

the schemes was prepared for approval of the provincial Planning and Development Department. The execution work was taken in hand, once the Government of Sindh approved the scheme and funds provided.

After the devolution the water and sanitation related functions were devolved to the TMAs and the scope of the PHE as a department was reduced to the office of a Director General (Technical) in the administrative ambit of the local government department. As an arrangement for providing institutional support to the TMAs, the government has created PHE as a Wing in the Local government department with regional offices at Hyderabad, Sukkur, Mirpurkhas and Larkana headed by an officer of BS-19. Likewise, it now has district support units at every district, headed by executive engineers in BS-18 to provide technical assistance / sanction to the TMAs in planning and execution of the WSS schemes.

The working relationship between LGD (PHE) and the TMAs has been further defined through notification dated 10 November 2006 (*Annexure-C*). Salient features of this order are given below:

- PHE has not been revived as a separate department but only created as a wing of the LGD to assist the provincial Governments and TMAs in planning & execution of water and sanitation related schemes.
- TMAs can plan and execute the water and sanitation Schemes to any amount from their own source and PHE will provide technical assistance/sanction in the planning and execution through its Regional directorates and Districts based support units.
- Town Officers (Infra structure) will work in coordination with the PHE in all those schemes, which will be executed by the PHE being beyond the scope of TMAs (Scheme of more than 10 million under Districts ADP, Inter –Districts, Provincial and federal funded Schemes etc.) TO (I&S) will remain under the administration and financial authority of their concerned TMAs.

Service record of all the Devolved PHE Sindh will be maintained at the LGD (PHE Wing) to ensure career furtherance of the staff on merit.

### **1.5.2 Complete Devolution of Administrative and Financial Powers to TMAs:**

After devolution of powers, the WSS related functions and the staff of the defunct PHED have been devolved to the TMAs. Under the devolved system the WSS schemes are planned, financed and executed by the TMAs independently. The Council approves the funds for schemes and the Town officer (I&S) prepares the scheme document including design and the cost estimates and the financial and administrative approval of the scheme

is granted by the TMA Nazim in line with the budgetary provisions followed by the tendering process.

**1.5.3 Devolution of Technical Sanction Powers:** Preparation of design and cost estimates is done by the engineers / officers in BS-17 who do not have the financial powers for approving the cost estimates with reference to the technical design of the scheme. Such approval is also known as the technical sanction of the scheme. This is more of a technical appraisal of the scheme. Under the Pakistan Works Department Rules and the Financial Rules-1962 the officers are assigned financial powers according to their grades or basic pay scales. According to these rules technical officers (Engineers) in grade 18 and above have the powers to approve the cost estimates with reference to the technical design of a scheme. In TMAs where officers in grade 18 or above are posted they provide technical sanction for the schemes prepared by the grade 17 officers. Officers in grade 18 have the powers for approving a scheme upto Rs. 0.6 million, grade 19 upto 3 million for WSS and 20 million for roads and buildings while officers in grade 20 have unlimited powers for technical approval of the schemes.

Following the rules and procedures the TMAs have complete technical sanction powers depending on the grade/level of the officer posted as TO (I&S) in the TMA. In Karachi and most of the bigger towns (like district headquarter towns) have TOs in grade 19 or 18. The smaller towns have TOs in grade 17. These TOs in lower grades are required to obtain technical sanction, depending upon the estimated cost of the scheme, from the grade 18 PHE officers in district support unit, from grade 19 officers in regional offices or grade 20 at provincial local government office.

**1.5.4 Technical Support to TMAs:** It is in this context that the provision of technical assistance to the TMAs becomes all the more important. To fill this capacity gap the local government department in Sindh has established district support units at every district, regional technical offices at every erstwhile divisional / regional headquarter and the office of the Director General at provincial level (located at Hyderabad) to provide technical support to the TMAs in planning and execution of the WSS related schemes. With the assistance from SDSSP the local government department has planned to conduct training for the TMA's officers in the areas of planning and monitoring.

## **1.6 Works and Services Department**

The office of Director General (Monitoring) was established and is performing its work after devolution of powers from the year 2001. The annual monitoring reports portray the efforts of works & services department in monitoring of roads and buildings schemes of both provincial as well as district governments. These reports include monitoring of materials, workmanship, quality control, allocation and utilization, planning and financial activities in the schemes. The report also contains a chapter on performance appraisal and provides the recommendations on best and poor performing field officers of works and services department. Executive summary of the report is attached as *Annexure-D*.

## **1.7 PFC's Monitoring of Fiscal Transfers to Local Governments**

For effective monitoring of the activities related to fiscal transfers from provincial government to local governments. PFC has following institutional set up in place:

- Each transfer to local government is made through PFC after ensuring that the transfers are in line with PFC Award;
- Report on fiscal transfers made to local governments since last PFC Award is presented before meeting of PFC for deliberation (one such report is attached as Flag-I);

For further strengthening of the monitoring of transfers to local governments, PFC is undertaking following activities:

To have proper monitoring of transfers, it is crucial to have information from local governments confirming transfers made by provincial government. This purpose is served by proformas given in Fiscal Transfer Rules, 2004 (FTRs). FTRs lay down the procedures of operation of PFC and different reporting mechanisms. Among other things FTRs deal with shares of local governments; gives Authorization of Transfers; Notification of Calculated Share is to be made; Certification of Receipts and information of receipts with different frequency.

To properly utilize incoming information through FTRs; a database is being developed through Technical Assistance of Decentralization Support Program (DSP). The design report of this database is attached as *Annexure –E*.

To enhance overall capacity of PFC for optimally performing its functions, PFC is receiving Technical Assistance from both DSP and Sindh Devolved Social Services Program (SDSSP). SDSSP is also providing Technical Assistance to PFC, which includes funding for training, surveys and studies, reports and communication, staff hiring and equipment purchase. DSP is also providing equipment, experts, and funds for surveys and studies to PFC.

## **1.8 Chief Minister's Inspections, Evaluation & Implementation Team (CMIE&IT)**

CMIE&IT is working as an attached department of Chief Minister's Secretariat for Inspection, Evaluation and Implementation of Development Schemes, M&R works and any special enquiry assignment entrusted by the Chief Executive of the Province. This Team is executing a project for establishing a Monitoring and Inspection Framework aimed at strengthening monitoring activities in all the sectors of Provincial/Districts/Talukas Governments at a total cost of Rs. 108.593 million for a period of 42 months. Salient features of the project are given below

- i. To improve the quality of services under Provincial Departments / District Government / Taluka Union Council and Town Municipal Administration.

- ii. To enhance efficiency within the Departments in general and Foreign Aided Projects in particular.
- iii. To improve the planning, implementation and management within the departments of Government of Sindh, District Government and TMAs/ Union Councils.
- iv. The sponsoring agency would also involve the Provincial and District Government Department concerned for monitoring the enquiries made including monitoring committees on on-going problematic projects.
- v. Community for monitoring purposes should be constituted in consultation with the District Governments.
- vi. Monthly progress report would be submitted by the sponsor agency to P&D Department regularly
- vii. Community Monitoring through NGOs
- viii. Media Campaigning to develop public awareness to facilitate monitoring
- ix. Hiring of experts for dealing with Mega Projects
- x. Training and Seminars to develop efficacy of monitoring among civil Society.
- xi. Research and studies of projects through universities

The progress reports of CMIE&IT containing information on monitoring role of CMIE&IT prove that the Governments efforts and resolve on comprehensive monitoring framework which is not donor driven only.

## **1.9 Third Party Validations**

The Government of Sindh has approved an institutional arrangement for Third Party Validation (TPV) of all the development projects / schemes. Now 1% of the total scheme cost would be used for the TPVs. The monitoring framework being established through CMIE&IT also provides for the TPVs. The agriculture department, Reform Support Unit (RSU) of the education department and the SDSSP have already initiated process for the TPV of their interventions.

## **1.10 Redressal of Grievances through Provincial Ombudsman**

The office of Provincial Ombudsman Sindh (POS) plays a key role in redressal of public grievances thus providing a base for the appraisal of the provincial departments and local governments. This institution is basically for the people who encounter glitches of delay, inefficiency, abuse of power, maladministration, mismanagement, unfairness, arbitrariness, excesses and corruption of the government functionaries. The Office of Ombudsman is being expanded to all the districts and in the first phase six regional offices have been established while the establishment of three more has been approved.

The POS is currently engaged in the strengthening of this institution with following objectives:

- i. Increasing the credibility of the institution
- ii. Expanding its outreach
- iii. Reduction in the turn around time

The institution of POS is easily accessible and the complaint process is free of cost. Autonomous status of the POS ensures impartiality in addressing excesses of public servants in delivery of services. The decisions and annual reports of Ombudsman Secretariat provide a continuous source of monitoring and performance appraisal for administrative departments district governments and semi government institutions.

### **1.11 The Sindh Local Government Commission**

The Sindh Local Government Commission (LGC) established under section 131 of the SLGO 2001 has been effectively performing functions outlined in section 132 as follows:

- i. conduct annual and special inspections of the local governments and submit reports to the Chief Executive of the Province;
- ii. conduct, on its own initiative or, whenever, so directed by the Chief Executive of the Province, an inquiry by itself or through District Government into any matter concerning a local government;
- iii. cause, on its own initiative or, whenever, so directed by the Chief Executive of the Province, a special audit by itself or direct a District Government to arrange a special audit, of any local government;
- iv. resolve disputes between any Department of the Government and District Government or between two District Governments;
- v. enquire into the matters referred to it by the District Coordination Officer under the provisions of sub-section (3) of section 28 of the SLGO and by the Government under sub-section (4) of section 30 and give its decision thereon or, as the case may be, make report to the competent authority; and
- vi. submit to the Chief Executive of the Province an annual report on the over-all performance of the district and Taluka level local governments.

Third tranche action A-i requires that “SPG monitors the implementation of delegation of administrative and financial powers and published a report”. As per mandate the PLGC has conducted Inspections of 21 Districts. The PLGC Monitoring Report on 13 Districts has been published and is attached as *Annexure-F*.

## **2. Benchmarking and Setting Minimum Service Standards**

The political devolution and administrative and financial decentralization has resulted in a paradigm shift in social service delivery. There is a need of a framework that governs the relations of provincial government with local governments. Such a framework will ensure that progress towards decentralization must also guarantee national and provincial objective of equitable coverage and acceptable service standards. The standard setting / benchmarking can also be used as a tool of accountability, principally to the provincial government but also to local constituents.

Government of Sindh and local government have been working on developing such a framework and progress in education, health and water, sanitation and solid waste management sector is at various stages. A brief synopsis for each sector is as follows:

### **2.1 Education**

District Government Kashmore has taken lead in education sector and the political leadership of the district has notified 'Education Policy' (*Annexure-G*). The Policy sets standards in following areas:

- Gender responsive planning and implementation
- Establishment of new schools
- Staff redeployment and transfer policy
- Preparation of improved roles and responsibilities of district, taluka and union council education officers/ officials
- Public Private Partnership
- Health and Sports activities
- Survey and data collection and
- Procurement guidelines for revenue component of education budget

### **2.2 Health**

The Health Department, in consultation with Planning & Development Department, has compiled standards for establishing health facilities (*Annexure-H*). These standards would also be used in allocation of salary, non-salary budget and for earmarking development activities. The document covers District Head-Quarter Hospital, Taluka Head-Quarter Hospital, Rural Health Center, and Basic Health Units. The areas covered are:

- i. Physical standards for the facility
- ii. Scope of services and

- iii. Human Resource requirement for following categories
  - a. Medical staff
  - b. Para-Medical staff
  - c. Administrative staff

### **2.3 Water, Sanitation, Solid Waste Management and Environment (WSS&E)**

The Program Support Unit (PSU)-SDSSP has compiled a draft document for benchmarking the (WSS&E) services (*Annexure-I*). This document setout standards and targets for Taluka Municipal Administration. The combination of the standards and targets will help the provincial and local leadership to take informed decisions regarding financial and administrative measures to improve the service delivery. A strategy for incorporating the views and suggestions various stakeholders, such as Local Government Department, Public Health Engineering wing, Towns/ TMAs and of civil society has also been prepared and initial contacts have been made. After incorporating the suggestions and observations of all the stakeholders the draft will then be submitted to government for notification.

### 3. Strengthening M&E Systems

It could be analysed from the review of existing monitoring systems at provincial and local government's levels that the systems are functional, the reports are generated and the performance, though to smaller extent, is based on the monitoring & evaluation process but need to be strengthened to perform in a more institutional manner that the findings of the M&E reports are made part of the broad sector policies and processes.

Sindh has however, made impressive innovation and progression on institutionalizing the monitoring mechanisms by taking following steps:

- (i) **Expanding M&E mechanisms:** Sindh is strengthening the M&E mechanisms with a view to bring internal and external accountability and transparency in the over all system of governance. Implementation Department, recently strengthened under Chief Secretary Sindh's direct supervision has established a framework under which entire development portfolio will be validated through public private partnership.

Moreover the Chief Minister's Inspection Team (CMIT) has been assigned a project for establishing a provincial Monitoring & Inspection framework that would be owned by all the line departments for supporting their departmental M&E systems.

- (ii) **Sector Wide / Budgetary Support Approach:** In a major shift from parallel project approach Government is increasingly preferring budget support modalities. The recent agreements with development partners such as ADB, EC, World Bank are in support of using and strengthening governments existing procedures. This new shift shows donors increasing confidence on governments fiduciary and M&E mechanisms. The institutional strengthening in shape of Monitoring Cell (P&D Department), RSU (Education Department), Planning & Monitoring Cell (Health Department), strengthened Provincial Local Government Commission (Local Government Department), Implementation Department (SGA&C Department) are the progressive steps taken by the Government to strengthen M&E system in congruence with devolution system and new development approaches.

- (iii) **Operationalization of SLGO's Mandated M&E System:** Comprising of public representatives, the council monitoring committees are now fully functional in all districts and TMAs. Moreover these committees are playing active role in planning and implementation of development plan

prepared for education, health, water & sanitation and other devolved sectors.

Comprising of public and technical members, the Local Government Commission's role in monitoring and facilitation of local governments has gained further momentum. Commission's reports in this regard shows government oversight role specially in i) monitoring of development schemes ii) governance and accountability issues iii) fiscal and financial review iv) and identification of capacity gaps and recommendations for remedial steps

- (iv) **Capacity Development:** In addition to government's regular programs for capacity development, i.e. staff development at civil service academics (NIPA, Tando Jam Academy for rural development, various training programs), government has achieved significant progress through various donor, federal initiatives. The capacity building exercises of Decentralization Support Program, National Commission for Human Development, and USAID-ESRA have achieved significant results.
  
- (v) **Benchmarking and Standard Setting:** The line departments in collaboration with SDSSP are involved in setting standards and benchmarking. The exercise has been given institutional cover by allocating significant percentage of PFC grants to performance. The recent initiatives of DoE-RSU, H-MIS, and Local Government Department are progress in right direction.

## **4. Establishing an Institutional Framework to Review Devolved Administrative and Financial Powers**

### **4.1 Implementation**

To have an institutionalized M&E arrangements for reviewing the performance of the LGs and the status of the devolution the provincial government has established a Review Committee for Monitoring & Evaluation (*Annexure-J*). This committee has further been divided in two working groups (*Annexure-K*), one each for the review of the administrative and financial powers with an objective of assessing:

- i. the efficacy of devolved powers whether a correct balance has been struck between the powers to be retained at the provincial level and those that need to be devolved
- ii. the adequacy of administrative and financial powers already devolved
- iii. problems in implementation and exercise of the devolved powers

Report on the implementation of the M&E framework was presented before M&E Committee for review and approval on 31 August 2006. The report was approved after due deliberations (*Annexure-L*).

### **4.2 Compendium**

The Local Government Department has compiled a Compendium, containing all the 'Order', "Rules", "Bye-laws", Letters' and 'Notification' issued after the devolution. The Compendium was submitted to Review Committee, on 31 August 2006, and was endorsed by the members unanimously. The Committee directed that publication should be shared with all stakeholders. The Committee also suggested that Compendium may be continuously updated and new Editions should be printed with regular intervals.

### **4.3 Working Groups**

Subsequently, the working group established for reviewing the administrative powers met on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2006 to review efficacy and adequacy of the devolved powers and the issues in the implementation of these powers. Working group considered the existing monitoring frameworks available in the Provincial Line Departments and the Delegation Plan approved by the Chief Secretary Sindh and response of the DGs on the delegation plan took further steps for the implementation of certain recommendations of the DGs. Proceedings of the working group meeting have been presented in the minutes of the working group meeting (*Annexure-M*).

## **5. Conclusion**

The strengthening of devolution is a continuous process, with adjustments being made both at provincial and local government levels. The recent decision of the Federal and Provincial government to bring college education back to provincial purview and strengthening of district governments and DCO offices by providing 'Magisterial' powers is the proof evolving devolved system in Pakistan and Sindh.

However, to ensure the sustainability of the process, within a legally laid down framework, it is essential the Provincial Government continue to monitor the devolution process and bring in necessary changes. In this context the M&E Review Framework has gained added significance. The members of the working groups are fully cognizant of this fact and have already recommended few important steps for evolving all inclusive, research based approach for meeting the goals and objectives, assigned to it.